

Matters, Issues & Questions:

Matter 1: Minerals – Building Stone

Question 47 - 53

Building Stone

47. In order to demonstrate that there is, as far as practicable, a sufficient supply of building stone (NPPF paragraph 142), should the Plan contain more information on the scale and type of main building stone produced in the Plan area and, as far as possible, an indication of reserves and how long it is estimated they might last?

There are different types of building stone produced in the Plan area, the different types of building stone are identified in the *Strategic Stone Study for North West Yorkshire (May 2012) (MEB20)* and *Strategic Stone Study for North East Yorkshire (May 2012) (MEB21)*. The overall deposits are extensive but variable in quality and it is difficult to identify viable resources within such a large area. The table below provides details of the active quarries and the type of stone they extract, all of the quarries are small scale and some are worked intermittently.

Site name	Type of stone	Details of stone	Uses
Gatherley Moor – Permitted until 28 February 2020	Sandstone	Alston sandstone – generally fine to medium grained, iron rich which gives an orange colour tinged with grey.	Building stone and used for flags and roofing tiles.
Grey Yaud – Permitted until 20 December 2036	Sandstone	Lower follifoot grit – coarse grain buff coloured sandstone	Repair and renovation of local buildings
Carkin Moor – Permitted until 31 July 2036	Sandstone	Alston sandstone – generally fine to medium grained, iron rich which gives an orange colour tinged with grey.	Building stone and used for flags and roofing tiles.
Melsonby - Permitted until 3 December 2012 (an additional application is awaiting determination)	Limestone	Underset limestone – grey base containing white or crystalline fossils, also known as Swaledale Fossil Limestone	Building stone
High Moor -	Limestone	Lower Magnesian	Quality building

Permitted until 28 July 2021		limestone – fine to coarse grained, pale yellow-white	stone
Low Grange - Permitted until 22 February 2042	Limestone	Underset limestone – grey base containing white or crystalline fossils, also known as Swaledale Fossil Limestone	Building stone
Went Edge - Permitted until 30 September 2023		Lower Magnesian limestone – fine to coarse grained, pale yellow-white	Quality building stone
Brotherton - Permitted until 31 December 2030	Limestone	Upper Magnesian limestone – Fine to coarse grained, pale yellow-white	Field walls and farm buildings, also used as a source of lime.
Aislaby – does not have a time limit as so small	Sandstone	Aislaby stone – medium to coarse grained, buff, yellow and brown in colour	Building stone, freestone, ashlar, farm buildings, walls and monumental sculptures
Lowther's Crag - Permitted until 6 December 2022	Sandstone	Saltwick sandstone - medium to coarse grained, buff, yellow and brown	Slabs, freestone, ashlar, quoins, walling stone and rubble fill

The Authorities consider that a further Main Modification could be, made to include this Table within the Plan to follow on from the text in Paragraph 5.82, in order to provide additional context and clarity.

There are no published reserves data for building stone in the Plan area, as detailed in the *North Yorkshire County Council Minerals Specific Paper March 2017 (MEB04)* and *North York Moors National Park Authority minerals technical paper October 2015 (MEB05)*.

Information on the distribution and supply of building stone is included in MEB04 Minerals and Waste Plan *Evidence Paper 2: Minerals Specific Evidence (non-aggregate minerals) (MEB04)* (see page 31, section 3.8). This summarises available information obtained during evidence gathering, survey work and consultation during preparation of the Plan. This Paper built upon a range of earlier work including the 2011 report by British Geological Survey: *Mineral Safeguarding Areas for North Yorkshire County Council* (BGS 2011) (SEB01) and comparable studies for the City of York and North York Moors National Park areas, contained in the evidence base for the Plan. This earlier work demonstrates the challenges in obtaining robust and consistent data to enable a reliable and quantifiable approach to future planning for this material. Reflecting this, the 2011 BGS report (SEB01) noted, at page 16, paragraph 3.8.1, that the

building stones industry is unique in many ways to the rest of the minerals industry, for reasons including that the suitability of a stone for building purposes depends on factors such as strength and durability, the size of blocks or slabs that can be extracted, colour, texture, bed thickness, ability to polish and ease of carving or sawing for mouldings (BGS, 2007) (LPA/18). BGS note that suitable sources can, therefore, be highly localised where subtle variations and lateral differences occur, despite apparently extensive resources being mapped. It is therefore not considered practicable to quantify the scale of resource potentially available in the Plan area, or to define geographical areas of resource with sufficient clarity to be of assistance for strategic Planning purposes.

In addition to these factors, it is noted that there is an absence of any detailed national strategic policy position, or specific requirements, relating to building stone, other than the general statement (NPPF Paragraph 142) that it is important that there is a sufficient supply of material to provide infrastructure and buildings, and the more specific policy in NPPF Paragraph 144, 9th bullet point that, in determining planning applications, MPAs should recognise the small scale nature and impact of building and roofing stone quarries, and the need for a flexible approach to the potentially long duration of planning permissions reflecting the intermittent or low rate of working at many sites. The approach taken in the Plan was also informed by work undertaken to gain a better understanding of potential influences from outside the Plan area on the availability of, and demand for, building stone. This is summarised in the *Duty to Cooperate Statement (CD03, page 71, Strategic Issue 11)* which concluded, based on that work, that a flexible policy response was appropriate.

Taking this into account, the approach in the Plan is to include a flexible criteria based policy (M15 - *Continuity of supply of building stone*) which provides opportunities for proposals to come forward under a broad range of circumstances and in a wide range of locations, whilst also allocating land where suitable proposals have been put forward. It is considered that this represents an appropriate and proportionate approach which will facilitate delivery of the national policy objective. To provide more information on the type of building stone in the Plan area the table provided in this response will be added to the Plan as a *Main Modification*.

48. Is the allocation of only one site (Land at Brows Quarry – MJP63), together with existing operating sites, enough to demonstrate that there are reasonable prospects of supplying sufficient building stone of the main types required throughout the Plan period?

As detailed in section 3.8.3 of the *North Yorkshire County Council Minerals Specific Paper March 2017 (MEB04)*, and paragraph 3.4.6 of *North York Moors National Park Authority minerals technical paper October 2015 (MEB05)* there is no published data for building stone production in North Yorkshire, North York Moors or from the sub-region or region available, including with respect to building stone output that is ancillary to crushed rock aggregate producing quarries.

Apart from MJP63 (Brows Quarry, Malton, page 65, CD18), the only other site put forward for allocation for building stone (and aggregate), was the discounted site MJP64 (Cropton Quarry). As set out in page 59 of the *Discounted Sites Summary Document* (SD18) it is not considered appropriate to allocate that site for reasons regarding highway, amenity, landscape impact and risk to a groundwater source for drinking water. It should be noted that site MJP64 lies to the north of a dormant site (also known as Cropton Quarry) which could re-open subject to the submission and determination of a new set of planning conditions, but it is not known what reserve remains in that site.

Furthermore, there is no express requirement in national policy to maintain a specific landbank level for building stone. Therefore, it is considered that Policy M15 provides sufficient flexibility to deal with reasonable prospects for building stone from existing sites, extensions to existing sites, potential re-opening of former sites and new sites to supply a historic requirement, etc.

49. In the event of identifying any shortfall during the Plan period, and in the absence of other suitable sites coming forward for allocation, could preferred areas or areas of search be designated for any of the main building stone types and if so, would this be appropriate?

There are no published reserves data for building stone in the Plan area and very limited information available on sales, as detailed in the *North Yorkshire County Council Minerals Specific Paper March 2017 (MEB04)* and *North York Moors National Park Authority Minerals Technical Paper October 2015 (MEB05)* so it is not practicable to identify any specific, quantifiable, shortfall. As noted in the response to Q. 47, the overall deposits are extensive but variable in quality and it is not considered that areas of suitable resource can be identified with sufficient confidence to enable identification of preferred areas or areas of search with a sufficient degree of confidence that they would be likely to yield viable sources of building stone. Therefore, it would not be appropriate to designate preferred areas or areas of search for building stone. See also the response to Q. 47.

50. In order to support the various stages of winning, working and processing of building stone, should Policy M15 (Continuity of supply of building stone) cover the stone products/processing industry?

No. There are essentially two types of stone mineral products for the stone products/processing industry, these are natural stone and man-made stone. Firstly, natural stone as the name suggests is stone which is a natural product that has been quarried. It is generally available to customers in blocks of various sizes, rocks and rubble. The larger blocks are available as blocks or dimensioned blocks for eventual use as roofing, walling, flagstones or for ornamental purposes by carving/sawing/working for internal building or external use. The rocks are available for random stone walling or dry stone walling and the rubble is available for track, sub base or building foundation filling. Building

Stone planning permissions (excepting national parks) do not inhibit excavated stone minerals being supplied to the products/processing industry, they are a natural part of the quarries range of products after blasting or hewing. Secondly, man-made stone, usually in the form of reconstituted stone or stone faced products are not made from building stone but are made from dyed/pigment coloured sand finished concrete, e.g. cast lintels, cast architectural items & roof/wall cappings. As such the raw material for this aspect of the stone products/processing industry comes from sand and gravel and crushed rock resources not building stone.

51. In accordance with NPPF paragraph 28, which encourages local plans to support rural enterprises, should there be specific policy support for sustainable stone processing at appropriate locations (e.g. quarries)?

There is already support for sustainable stone processing at appropriate locations within Policy I02 (*Locations for ancillary minerals infrastructure*). As such, it is suggested that within the 'key links to other relevant policies and objectives' section at the foot of Policy M15, Policy I02 is referenced along with additional explanatory justification at end of paragraph 5.86. A relevant modification will be included in the 'Main Modifications' document to reflect this.

52. Policy M15, paragraph 2 seems to allow for a greater, more general scope of production if the building stone is for outside the area i.e. for "**important requirements** ... outside the area"; whereas for inside the area it needs to make a more specific contribution to "the quality of the **built and/or historic environment**". Is this intended? Is this too restrictive? (My emphasis)

A restrictive approach has been taken as building stone is relatively scarce in the Plan area and given it is a finite resource the policy seeks to ensure that proposals meet the needs of the Plan area first, in order to maintain the quality of the built environment. This is considered to be justified in an area where the quality of the built environment is particularly high (National Park, AONB and the City of York). The Policy does allow for some flexibility for meeting a requirement outside the Plan area, but only where justified (as explained in paragraph 5.88).

53. Is there sufficient support in the Plan for other stone uses including internal decoration and other stone products? How does the Plan support other potential stone markets that might develop over the Plan period?

Yes, Policy M15 and Policy I02, between them, seek to ensure that there is sufficient continuity of building stone available in the form required to meet both the mainstream construction industry need for natural stone and stone products together with specialist architectural and ornamental industries. Paragraph 5.82

states that building stone includes material used for roofing, walling, flagstones or ornamental purposes.

Aggregates supply policies in the Plan will serve to provide the reconstituted stone industries with the mineral products they require. With raw mineral products available it is considered that the bulk of the support for potential stone markets would lie within District & Borough Local Plans which deal with the support for Use Class B2 (General Industrial) proposals.

Prepared by;

**North Yorkshire County Council
City of York Council
North York Moors National Park Authority**

Appendix

Matters Issues & Questions:

Matter 1: Minerals – Building Stone

Question 47 - 53

Main Modifications

The modifications below are expressed either in the conventional form of ~~strikethrough~~ for deletions and underlining for additions of text.

The page numbers and paragraph numbering below refer to the submission local plan, and do not take account of the deletion or addition of text.

Ref	Page	Policy/ Paragraph	Main Modification												
Q47	72	5.83	<p>Add additional sentence and table to end of Para:</p> <p><u>The following table identifies active building stone sites in the Joint Plan area and the details of the stone extracted and uses.</u></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Site name</th> <th>Type of stone</th> <th>Details of stone</th> <th>Uses</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Gatherley Moor Permitted Until 28th February 2020</td> <td>Sandstone</td> <td>Alston sandstone – generally fine to medium grained, iron rich which gives an orange colour tinged with grey.</td> <td>Building stone and used for flags and roofing tiles.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Grey Yaud Permitted until 20 December 2036</td> <td>Sandstone</td> <td>Lower follifoot grit – coarse grain buff coloured sandstone</td> <td>Repair and renovation of local buildings</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Site name	Type of stone	Details of stone	Uses	Gatherley Moor Permitted Until 28 th February 2020	Sandstone	Alston sandstone – generally fine to medium grained, iron rich which gives an orange colour tinged with grey.	Building stone and used for flags and roofing tiles.	Grey Yaud Permitted until 20 December 2036	Sandstone	Lower follifoot grit – coarse grain buff coloured sandstone	Repair and renovation of local buildings
Site name	Type of stone	Details of stone	Uses												
Gatherley Moor Permitted Until 28 th February 2020	Sandstone	Alston sandstone – generally fine to medium grained, iron rich which gives an orange colour tinged with grey.	Building stone and used for flags and roofing tiles.												
Grey Yaud Permitted until 20 December 2036	Sandstone	Lower follifoot grit – coarse grain buff coloured sandstone	Repair and renovation of local buildings												

Ref	Page	Policy/ Paragraph	Main Modification				
				Carkin Moor Permitted until 31 July 2036	Sandstone	Alston sandstone – generally fine to medium grained, iron rich which gives an orange colour tinged with grey.	Building stone and used for flags and roofing tiles.
				Melsonby Permitted until 3 December 2012 (an additional is awaiting determination)	Limestone	Underset limestone – grey base containing white or crystalline fossils, also known as Swaledale Fossil Limestone	Building stone
				High Moor Permitted until 28 July 2021	Limestone	Lower magnesian limestone – fine to coarse grained, pale yellow-white	Quality building stone
				Low Grange Permitted until 22 February 2042	Limestone	Underset limestone – grey base containing white or crystalline fossils, also known as Swaledale Fossil Limestone	Building stone
				Went Edge Permitted until September 2023		Lower magnesian limestone – fine to coarse grained,	Quality building stone

Ref	Page	Policy/ Paragraph	Main Modification				
						pale yellow-white	
				Brotherton Permitted until 31 December 2030	Limestone	Upper magnesian limestone – Fine to coarse grained, pale yellow-white	Field walls and farm buildings, also used as a source of lime.
				Aislaby (Does not have a time limit as so small, but has a resource limit instead)	Sandstone	Aislaby stone – medium to coarse grained, buff, yellow and brown in colour	Building stone, freestone, ashlar, farm buildings, walls and monumental sculptures
				Lowther’s Crag Permitted until 6 December 2022	Sandstone	Saltwick sandstone - medium to coarse grained, buff, yellow and brown	Slabs, freestone, ashlar, quoins, walling stone and rubble fill
Q51	73	M15	Revise ‘Key links to other relevant policies and objectives’ table: <i>M10, <u>I02</u>, S01, D04, D08</i>				
Q51	73	5.86	Add additional sentences to end of paragraph: <u>Building stone quarries are typically relatively small in scale but, as a result of the need to source stone of particular technical or aesthetic properties, may sometimes be proposed in sensitive locations with the potential for impacts on the environment or local communities. It is therefore important that proposals can demonstrate compliance with other relevant policies in the Joint Plan. Proposals for sustainable stone processing of materials from a quarry including; sawing, tooling and screening would need to demonstrate compliance with the development management and other infrastructure policies in the Joint Plan.</u>				