

Norton Action Group

134a Welham Road
Norton, Malton
North Yorkshire
YO17 9DU
john@jmhoward.co.uk

Ms Carmel Edwards
Programme Officer
Minerals & Waste Joint Plan
North Yorkshire County Council
County Hall
Northallerton
North Yorkshire
DL7 8BR

2nd Feb 2018

Dear Ms Edwards

Minerals & Waste Joint Plan, Whitewall Quarry

We are writing to you in response to the draft Matters, Issues and Questions raised by the Planning Inspector, dated 18th January 2018. In particular, question 33 relating to Whitewall Quarry.

The tables below¹ provide the figures to support the statement “that there is no need to release additional reserves of Jurassic Limestone”.

Table 3.1: Yorkshire and Humber land-won aggregate sales 2006-2015 (million tonnes)

Sub-Region	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
Aggregate Sand and Gravel Sales										
North Yorkshire	2.7	2.7	2.3	1.7	1.6	1.7	1.6	1.5	1.7	1.7
South and West Yorkshire ¹	0.5	0.4	0.4	0.5	0.26	0.24	0.24	0.18	0.21	0.54
East Riding and North Lincolnshire	1.2	1.3	1.13	1.0	0.59	0.71	0.56	0.91	0.93	0.92
Total Yorkshire and Humber	4.4	4.4	3.83	3.2	2.45	2.65	2.4	2.59	2.83	3.16
Aggregate Crushed Rock Sales										
North Yorkshire	7.7	8.3	7.7	5.3	5.51	4.45	5.33	5.65	6.49	7.04
South Yorkshire	2.6	2.3	2.2	1.4	1.1	1.05	1.14	1.27	2.25	2.4
West Yorkshire	1.1	1.1	0.9	0.9	0.53	0.43	0.79	0.78	1.03	1.03
East Riding and North Lincolnshire	0.3	0.3	0.2	0.1	0.16	0.23	0.21	0.21	0.75	0.75
Total Yorkshire and Humber	11.7	12.0	11.0	7.7	7.30	6.16	7.47	7.91	10.52	11.22

1. Sand and Gravel Sales Combined to maintain commercial confidentiality.

Table 3.2: Yorkshire and Humber land-won aggregate reserves 2006-2015 (million tonnes)

Sub-Region	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
Aggregate Land-won Sand and Gravel Reserves										
North Yorkshire	22.85	20.65	20.02	18.4	17.98	16.24	19.1	18.63	16.9	19.5
South Yorkshire	10.3	10.14	10	5	5.7	5.79	5.67	5.95	2.29	4.2
West Yorkshire	-	-	-	0.33	0.25	0.2	0.14	0	0.88	0.99
East Riding and North Lincolnshire	-	-	-	14.4	9.3	11.1	9.7	8.1	7.9	7.06
Total Yorkshire and Humber	33.15	30.79	30.02	38.13	33.23	33.33	34.61	32.68	27.97	31.75
Aggregate crushed rock Reserves										
North Yorkshire	233.2	225.1	220.7	210.1	204.6	202.2	191.82	189.79	185.91	178.99
South Yorkshire	62.8	60.8	58.8	63.4	62.4	61.23	60.8	59.5	57.6	56.58
West Yorkshire	41.8	40.8	40	27.14	15.74 ⁽¹⁾	15.44 ⁽¹⁾	28.5	30.4	25.7	33.74
East Riding and North Lincolnshire	-	-	-	1.7	5.6	10.78	10.88	12.7	12.95	13.39
Total Yorkshire and Humber	337.8	326.7	319.5	302.34	288.34	289.65	292	292.39	282.16	282.7

1. Data incomplete

¹ Yorkshire and Humber Aggregate Working Party. Annual Report 2016.

In 2015 crushed rock sales in North Yorkshire were 7.04 million tonnes against reserves of 178.99 m te giving a current reserve of 25 years.

Furthermore there are three quarries nearby producing limestone aggregate:

Quarry	Post Code	Operator	Road Distance from Whitewall, miles
Wath	YO62 4LT	Lafarge Aggregates	8.4
Settrington	YO17 8NP	Fenstone Minerals Ltd	4.6
Greenwich	YO42 1YR	Fenstone Minerals Ltd	12.4

Whitewall Quarry was first opened in the 1940s and has been in the ownership of the present operators, W C Watts Ltd, since 1956². It is a working quarry, given permission in 2007 to extract limestone until 2023³. The limestone is supplied as crushed aggregate for building and lime for agriculture. The quarry does not supply building stone.

In 2008 Clifford Watts Ltd was granted ancillary permission⁴ to supply ready-mix concrete and to manufacture concrete products. This substantially increased the number of heavy goods vehicle movements through the centres of Malton & Norton. On Thursday 2nd October 2014 the Norton Action Group surveyed the number of vehicle movements travelling to and from the quarry along Welham Road.

	NAG Survey	Applicant's Proposal	Applicant's Vehicle Logs August 2013
Total No. of HGV movements	118	77	
No. of quarry vehicle movements	72	55	Average 63
No. of ready-mix movements	40	14	
No. of concrete products movements	4	8	
No. of grab-hire vehicle movements	2	0	

The above survey did not include traffic travelling south from the quarry.

In 2015 the Clifford Watts Ltd was denied permission to open an asphalt plant⁵ under Appeal Decision APP/P2745/A/15//3002825. The Inspector made his decision based on the following:

From what I have heard, read and seen, I consider that this appeal turns on whether:

- i) the scheme would constitute sustainable development or entail an unsustainable proposal inappropriately located in the countryside, and*
- ii) the siting, design and operation of the project would unacceptably exacerbate its environmental impact or appropriately mitigate the potentially harmful effects of any associated traffic, dust and noise.*

The inspector goes on to state in paragraph 37 of his decision:

Moreover, even if the lorry routing arrangements were to operate successfully [to avoid Malton Air Quality Management Area], much of the additional HGV traffic would be routed via Welham Road and Commercial Street, the latter being the centre of Norton. Although the evidence demonstrates that such traffic could be physically accommodated, it would add to the traffic already traversing these streets and increase the incidence of HGVs there, so further denuding the quality of Norton's commercial centre. This would not contribute to the vitality, viability and attractiveness of Norton, or enhance public areas or reflect the aim of instigating traffic management measures to improve the pedestrian experience in the town. On the contrary, this would exacerbate the presence of HGVs, so undermining an aim of the Plan to create an inviting appearance in Commercial Street to attract and retain custom and to counteract

² NYCC Planning & Regulatory Functions Committee Report 10 Feb 2015, paragraph 2.19

³ Planning Application NY/2007/0247/FUL.

⁴ Planning Application NY/2008/0444/FUL

⁵ Planning Application NY/2012/0340/FUL

those signs that the place risks falling into decline. As such, the routing arrangements proposed would undermine the aims of policy SP7.

Since the above judgement was made the traffic situation has deteriorated further:

1. A 13 tonne weight limit has been placed on Kirkham Bridge preventing southward access for HGVs to the A64.
2. All north bound traffic must pass through a four-way road junction at the end of Welham Road. Through this junction runs the railway line from York to Scarborough. Arriva Rail North Ltd has been granted a franchise⁶ (commencing in May 2019) to operate an additional service between York and Scarborough, doubling the number of train movements to four per hour. Effectively closing this important junction between the towns of Norton and Malton for some 20 minutes in every hour.
3. Castlegate has been the site of an Air Quality Management Order⁷ for nitrogen dioxide since December 2009. Castlegate is heavily congested, particularly when the railway gates are closed. To reduce the congestion and pollution the feasibility of closing County Bridge across the River Derwent to heavy goods vehicles is currently under consideration.
4. The populations of Malton and Norton are increasing substantially with plans to build 1500 new homes in the period 2012 to 2027⁸. At busy times traffic congestion is already severe in both town centres. It is not unknown for the journey time from the railway crossing to Malton town centre to take over 10 minutes, a distance of only 600 yards.

Whitewall quarry is situated in an inappropriate location on the edge of an already polluted and congested market town. Heavy goods vehicles from the quarry delivering to the north must pass through either the commercial centre of Malton or Norton.

The quarry has permission to operate for a further 5 years, sufficient time for the operator to establish a new operation on a more appropriate site. His application for an asphalt plant met with considerable local opposition and was eventually denied after nearly three years of deliberation and appeals. It is likely that the operator will meet similar opposition if he seeks permission to extend his operations beyond 2023.

Yours sincerely

John Howard
On behalf of Norton Action Group
Sent by e-mail 2-Feb-18
Carmel.Edwards@northyorks.gov.uk

⁶ Department of Transport, Northern Franchise Train Service Requirements, December 2015

⁷ Ryedale District Council, Malton Air Quality Management Area Order 2009.

⁸ Ryedale District Council, Strategic Housing Land Availability Assessment Update 2017, table 3.



Location of Whitewall Quarry⁹
South of Norton

⁹ Reproduced from Google Maps.



Traffic in the Castlegate AQMA waiting for the railway gates to open.
Note HGV unable to pass parked traffic and the
white vehicle on the right unable to exit from Morrisons' car park



Heavy traffic passing through
Norton Commercial Street.



Traffic on Welham Road waiting at the railway crossing.
Note traffic violation on the right
Note vehicle on the left unable to leave Lidl car park